MINING PERMIT APPLICATION FOR INZALO

CRUSHING & AGGREGATES (PTY) LTD

COMMENTS AND RESPONSE REPORT

REFERENCE NUMBER: KZN 30/5/1/3/2/10724MP

JANUARY 2021





NOTIFICATION TO STAKEHOLDERS AND I&AP'S DURING PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PHASE

COMMENTING PERIOD: 13 OCTOBER - 13 NOVEMBER 2020

During the public participation process the stakeholders and I&AP's were informed of the project by means of background information documents that were sent to the contact persons. An advertisement was placed in the Ilanga News on 12 October 2020 and on-site notices were placed on 01 October 2020 at the entrance to the farm, and the intersection of the R33 and the D173 road turnoff towards the Karkloof Safari Spa. A 30-days commenting period was allowed which expired on 13 November 2020. The following table provides a list of the I&AP's and stakeholders that were informed of the project:

STAKEHOLDERS			
TITLE, NAME AND SURNAME	AFFILIATION/KEY STAKEHOLDER STATUS	CONTACTED DATE	RESPONSE RECEIVED
Dr R Ngcobo	uMgungundlovu District Municipality	13 October 2020	No Comments Received
Mr M Mabaso	uMshwati Local Municipality	13 October 2020	No Comments Received
Cllr CS Zuma-Dube	uMshwati Local Municipality: Ward 10	13 October 2020	No Comments Received
Me Bernadet Pawandiwa	AMAFA / Heritage KZN	30 September 2020	13 October 2020

STAKEHOLDERS					
TITLE, NAME AND SURNAME	TITLE, NAME AND SURNAME AFFILIATION/KEY STAKEHOLDER STATUS CONTACTED DATE RESPONSE RECEIVE				
 30 September 2020 – Greenmined submitted a Needs and Desirability application (hard copy) to AMAFA for their consideration; 13 October 2020 – Greenmined sent the BID and application Map to AMAFA for their perusal; 13 October 2020 – AMAFA request the submission of Form J; 16 October 2020 – Greenmined uploaded the second application (including Form J) onto the SAHRIS website and informed AMAFA of its availability; 02 November 2020 – AMAFA acknowledge receipt of the application, and requested additional payment; 02 November 2020 – Greenmined noted that the correct amount was already paid and supplied AMAFA with proof of payment. AMAFA acknowledge receipt of the proof of payment. To date no feedback has been received from AMAFA. 					
Mr Dominic Wieners	Ezemvelo / KZN Wildlife	13 October 2020	No Comments Received		
Mr Siza Sibande	Department of Agriculture and Rural Development	13 October 2020	No Comments Received		
Mr Shawn Janneker	Department of Economic Development, Tourism and Environmental Affairs	13 October 2020	28 October 2020		
Comments received from the DEDTEA during the initial public participation period: "1. The Background Information Document (BID) submitted in respect of the above-mentioned project, received by the Department on 23 October 2020, refers. 2. This Department has reviewed the BID and requires that the following issues be addressed in the Final FBAR.					

3. The BID must include a detailed project description; proposed footprint, structure sizes for the offices; workshops; storage rooms; and temporary wash bay; ablution, parking; etc.

STAKEHOLDERS				
TITLE, NAME AND SURNAME	AFFILIATION/KEY STAKEHOLDER STATUS	CONTACTED DATE	RESPONSE RECEIVED	
 4. A filling station is also to be included to the proposed development and the FBAR need to include the cubic capacity on the dangerous good storage (underground storage and above – ground storage) as well as the listed activities for the petrol filling station (GNR 327 activity 4, and GNR 324 activity 10) in the FBAR. 5. Kindly note that in you BID document makes reference to "the proposed mining footprint extends over an undisturbed section of the property that is occasionally used for gazing". Agriculture land is prime and used for agricultural purposes (food security). Therefore, the applicant is required to explore all types of alternatives according to chapter one of the EIA regulations 2017. 6. Kindly include the zonation for the site. 				
and what quantity of water will be p 8. The BID makes reference to g	e bought and where will it be stored after being after being purcha burchased. Will water be sourced from any other dams/watercours enerators to supply power to the mining infrastructure. Kindly spe	es?		
 9. A letter from Eskom must be inc 10. Comments are to be include landowners, farmers associations, 	itigation measures to address the noise impact. Iuded in the FBAR for the supply of electricity. ed of potential Interested and Affected Parties; state departmer neighbours; and local farmers. Environmental Management Framework (EMF) Status Report must			
areas of the site. 12. Kindly indicate how waste will I	be managed on site.			
 An Air Emission Licence may be required and must be obtained from the Umgungundlovu District Municipality. The contact person is Mr Brendon Rajoo, Cell Number: 079 491 2148. Building plan must be submitted and approved by the Umgungundlovu District Municipality. A copy of the facility illustrations Layout Plan is to be incorporated into the FBAR. All specialist studies should be ground truth and meet the requirements of Appendix 6 of the EIA regulations 2014 (as amended). 				
Response to the comments received from the DEDTEA:				
3. The detailed project description	n is discussed in this document under Part A(1)(d) Description of the	e scope of the proposed overall ac	ctivity.	
	d)(ii) Description of the activities to be undertaken, the low agricultury brick factory, and the development of a filling station (by a separ			

STAKEHOLDERS					
TITLE, NAME AND SURNAME AFFILIATION/KEY STAKEHOLDER STATUS CONTACTED DATE RESPONSE RECEIVED					
	(if approved) must be seen as separate projects (different entities) of Aggregates (Pty) Ltd mining permit application and therefor does n		station development does not form		
5. Refer to Part A(1)(h)(i) Details of	of the development footprint alternatives considered.				
6. The property is zoned as Comm	nercial Agricultural.				
7. Refer to Part A(1)(d)(ii) Description	tion of the activities to be undertaken – 2. Operational Phase: Wate	er Use.			
	tion of the activities to be undertaken – 2. Operational Phase: Elect nitigation measures that could be applied and the level of risk – Noi	-			
9. Eskom will be contacted regard	ing the possible supply of electricity. Any correspondence received	d from them will be incorporated ir	nto the FBAR.		
 10. Refer to Part A(1)(h)(ii) Details of the Public Participation Process Followed; and Appendix F – Comments and Response Report & Proof of Public Participation Process. 11. Refer to Part A(1)(e) Policy and Legislative Context; and 					
	Part A(1)(h)(iv)(1)(a) Type of environment affected by the proposed activity – Biodiversity Conservation Areas. 12. Refer to Part A(1)(d)(ii) Description of the activities to be undertaken – 2. Operational Phase: Waste Handling.				
13. The proposed mining activity does not trigger an application for an air emissions licence. Refer to Part A(1)(h)(iv)(c) Description of specific environmental features and infrastructure on the site - Site Specific Air and Noise Quality.					
14. The permit holder will make use of temporary infrastructure for the duration of the mining activity. However, should the uMgungundlovu District Municipality request the submission of building plans, the permit holder will comply.					
15. Refer to Appendix C for a copy	of the Site Activities Map.				

STAKEHOLDERS					
TITLE, NAME AND SURNAME	AFFILIATION/KEY STAKEHOLDER STATUS	CONTACTED DATE	RESPONSE RECEIVED		
earmarked property. The spec	16. Alletson Ecological & Amanzi Aquatics (Pty) Ltd were contracted to do a Vegetation, Aquatic and Risk Assessment (VARA) for the proposed dolerite quarry on the earmarked property. The specialists visited the site in September/October 2020 to assess the actual ecological state and current land-use in the area, and the VARA (Appendix G) was compiled in accordance with the requirements of Appendix 6 of the EIA Regulations, 2014 (as amended).				
Mr Ashley Starkey	Department of Human Settlements Water and Sanitation	13 October 2020	No Comments Received		
Miss Simango Ngubo	Department of Transport	13 October 2020	No Comments Received		
Me T Kunene	Department of Labour	13 October 2020	No Comments Received		
Mr Troy Govendor	Eskom Ltd	13 October 2020	No Comments Received		
Director General	National Department of Agriculture Land Reform and Rural Development	13 October 2020	No Comments Received		
Heritage Officer	South African Heritage Resources Agency (SAHRA)	13 October 2020	No Comments Received		

STAKEHOLDERS			
TITLE, NAME AND SURNAME	AFFILIATION/KEY STAKEHOLDER STATUS	CONTACTED DATE	RESPONSE RECEIVED
Me Lynn Boucher	Department of Land Affairs	30 September 2020	08 October 2020
The office of the Regional Land Claims Commissioner: KZN advised that their records indicated that no claim for restitution in terms of the provision of the Restituion of Land Rights Act, 22 of 1994 (as amened) has been lodged in respect of the property in question.			

LAWFUL LAND USERS / SURROUNDING LANDOWNERS / INTERESTED AND AFFECTED PARTIES				
TITLE, NAME AND SURNAME AFFILIATION /PROPERTY DESCRIPTION CONTACTED DATE RESPONSE RECEIVED				
Rookhiya Bee Bee Moosa Mr Naaz Moosa	Landowner: ◆ Portion 0 (Remaining Extent) of the farm Thandisizwe No 16691	Inzalo Crushing and Aggregates (Pty) Ltd entered into a lease agreement with Mr Moosa who supports the application.		
Nurden Oliver Wyndham Mr Oliver Nurden (Owner) Mr Ted Hesom (Tenant)	Neighbour: Portion 17 of the farm Retief No 884.	13 October 2020	No Comments Received	

LAWFUL LAND USERS / SURROUNDING LANDOWNERS / INTERESTED AND AFFECTED PARTIES			
TITLE, NAME AND SURNAME	AFFILIATION /PROPERTY DESCRIPTION	CONTACTED DATE	RESPONSE RECEIVED
Skhuma Skins of Africa CC	Neighbour: Portion 23 of the farm Retief No 884.	13 October 2020	No Comments Received
Nanxing Bricks & Tiles (Pty) Ltd Mr David Trevor	 Neighbour: ✤ Portion 1 (Remaining Extent) of the farm Alida Mount No 1347. 	13 October 2020	No Comments Received
Alzura Inv CC Sansha Investments CC Mr Sunjeev Singh	 Neighbour: Portion 2 of the farm Thandisizwe No 16691. Portion 0 of the farm Thornridge No 17217. 	13 October 2020	No Comments Received
Greenville Trading 6 CC Mr Andile Buthelezi	 Neighbour: ✤ Portion 0 of the farm Whispers No 17478. ✤ Portion 10 of Lot 37 No 1294. 	13 October 2020	No Comments Received
Mrs Nirmala Singh	Neighbour: Portion 9 of the farm Zeekoegat No 17216.	19 October 2020	No Comments Received
Mr Tom Lam care of Mr Magnus van Rooyen	Lawful Land User: ✤ Portion 0 (Remaining Extent) of the farm Thandisizwe No 16691.	18 October 2020	10 November 2020

LAWFUL LAND USERS / SURROUNDING LANDOWNERS / INTERESTED AND AFFECTED PARTIES				
TITLE, NAME AND SURNAME	AFFILIATION /PROPERTY DESCRIPTION	CONTACTED DATE	RESPONSE RECEIVED	
Additional comments received from Mr Van Rooyen on 10 November 2020: "As a first query from our side, can you please confirm if any blasting will take place during the mining operations associated with the Mining Permit and if so, what mitigation measures will be put in place to monitor/prevent/repair any potential structural damage to my client's factory and associated buildings. Similarly, is an upgrade planned for the intersection between the access road from the Mining Permit Area and the Greytown Road?".				
 Upgrade planned for the intersection between the access road from the Mining Permit Area and the Greytown Road?". Greenmined responded as follows on 16 November 2020: "1. The proposed mining method does include blasting. The mitigation measures will be elaborated on in the draft basic assessment report that will follow shortly, and that will be available for your perusal and commenting, but thus far I can confirm that: Before blasting, the structural integrity of the infrastructure near the proposed mining footprint will be determined; Blasting will be done in accordance with the USBM standards and measures will be implemented to limit flyrock; During a blast, vibration measuring equipment (seismograph) will be placed at the brick factory to measure the ground vibrations that extents from the quarry. Should the vibration testing indicated excessively high readings the blasting at the quarry will be amended to lower the impact. Any structural damage, that resulted as a direct cause of the mining at the quarry, will be repaired at the cost of the Applicant. Mr Lam will be notified in advance of each blasting. 				

2. The permit holder will maintain the access (gravel) road to the quarry that turns onto the farm from the Greyton road (R33). Upon closure of the quarry the road will be left in a condition that will at least represent the pre-mining status."

SUMMARY OF INITIAL PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PROCESS

The I&AP's and stakeholders were informed of the proposed project through:

- telephonic discussions;
- direct communication with background information documents;
- placement of on-site notices (01 October 2020); and
- the placement of an advertisement in the llanga Newspaper on 12 October 2020.

To date the following I&AP's and stakeholders were registered on the project:

- Department of Economic Development, Tourism Environmental Affairs-KZN; and
- Mr Tom Lam care of Mr Magnus van Rooyen.

See Appendix F2 for proof of the correspondence with the I&AP's and stakeholders during the public participation process.

DRAFT BASIC ASSESSMENT REPORT'S AVAILABILITY TO STAKEHOLDERS AND I&AP'S

COMMENTING PERIOD: 26 NOVEMBER 2020 – 15 JANUARY 2021 (EXTENDED UNTIL 22 JANUARY 2021)

In accordance with the timeframes stipulated in the EIA Regulations of December 2014 (amended by GNR 326 effective 7 April 2017) the Draft Basic Assessment Report (DBAR) was compiled and distributed for commenting and perusal to the I&AP's and stakeholders listed above. A 30-day commenting period, ending 15 January 2021, that was extended until 22 January 2021, was allowed for perusal of the documentation and submission of comments. The following table provides a list of the I&AP's and stakeholders that were invited to comment on the project:

	STAKEHOLDERS			
TITLE, NAME AND SURNAME	AFFILIATION/KEY STAKEHOLDER STATUS	CONTACTED DATE	RESPONSE RECEIVED	
Dr R Ngcobo	uMgungundlovu District Municipality	26 November 2020	No Comments Received	
Mr M Mabaso	uMshwati Local Municipality	26 November 2020	No Comments Received	
Cllr CS Zuma-Dube	uMshwati Local Municipality: Ward 10	26 November 2020	No Comments Received	
Me Bernadet Pawandiwa	AMAFA / Heritage KZN	26 November 2020	No Comments Received	

STAKEHOLDERS					
TITLE, NAME AND SURNAME	AFFILIATION/KEY STAKEHOLDER STATUS CONTACTED DATE RESPONSE RECI				
Mr Dominic Wieners	Ezemvelo / KZN Wildlife	26 November 2020	01 December 2020		
	o only consider applications once the hard/electronic copies of the r ith an electronic copy of the DBAR on 01 December 2020. To date				
Mr Siza Sibande	Department of Agriculture and Rural Development	26 November 2020	No Comments Received		
Mr Shawn Janneker Me Janine Cumberledge	Department of Economic Development, Tourism and Environmental Affairs	26 November 2020	21 January 2021		
Comments received from DEDTEA on the DBAR (21 January 2021): "1. This Department has reviewed the Draft BAR and requires that the following issues be addressed in the Final BAR:					
2. The Department has reviewed the relevant spatial datasets and has established that the proposed development falls within areas that have been identified as being sensitive in terms of the uMgungundlovu District Environmental Management Framework (i.e. High agricultural, biodiversity, water quality constraints and is within a 500 m buffer of a wetland). Kindly consider other specified activities in terms of the sensitivity of the proposed site.					
 Letters from all relevant service providers must be included in the Final BAR with their contact details in respect to the collection and disposal of waste. All hazardous waste must be disposed at a suitably licenced landfill site. A service the Water Les Licence must be included in the FDAD. 					
4. A copy of the Water Use Licence must be included in the FBAR.					

STAKEHOLDERS					
TITLE, NAME AND SURNAME AFFILIATION/KEY STAKEHOLDER STATUS CONTACTED DATE RESPONSE RECEIVED					
	osed mining site area (S1) will be reached via an existing farm ro ridened or lengthened, then kindly consider Listing Notice 1 Activity	-	lo proposes to upgrade the road".		
	at be appointed to identify and relocate sensitive plant species prior obtained from KZN Wildlife for the relocation of plants.	to any site works and must ensur	e a Plant Rescue Plan be included		
7. All concerns raised by Interested	d and Affected Parties, must be addressed adequately in the FBAR				
	equirements of Appendix 1 of the EIA Regulations, 2014 (as amend Appendix 4 of the EIA regulations, 2014 (as amended) and all spe mended)."		• • • • • •		
Response to the DBAR comments	received from DEDTEA:				
2. The Department has reviewed the relevant spatial datasets and has established that the proposed development falls within areas that have been identified as being sensitive in terms of the uMgungundlovu District Environmental Management Framework (i.e. High agricultural, biodiversity, water quality constraints and is within a 500 m buffer of a wetland). Kindly consider other specified activities in terms of the sensitivity of the proposed site.					
Agriculture: As mentioned earlier, the dolerite intrusion at the earmarked footprint area results in shallow topsoil with low vegetation cover, that highly reduces the agricultural potential of the specific study area. Therefore, even though the framework indicates the region to be of high agricultural importance, the site specific conditions do not support this classification and therefore an alternative use (mining) is proposed. No listed activities, other than Listing Notice 1 Activity 28, is deemed applicable to this application.					
brickworks, nearby low income h condition due to frequent veld bu that the mitigatory measures put	<u>Biodiversity</u> : Ground-truthing (VARA) confirmed that the landscape around the proposed quarry site is already transformed by (amongst others) shale mining, brickworks, nearby low income housing (Copesville) and sugar cane farming. The groundcover of the site specific study area (S1) was found to be in a generally poor condition due to frequent veld burning and overgrazing. The VARA notes that the quarry will have relatively little impact on the vegetation and fauna around it provided that the mitigatory measures put forward (in this report) are adhered to. Since the earmarked footprint (S1) is already degraded and ground-truthing confirmed that it is not rated as being of high conservation priority, it is the opinion of the specialist that the impacts on the vegetation do not constitute a fatal flaw to the proposed project				

STAKEHOLDERS			
TITLE, NAME AND SURNAME	AFFILIATION/KEY STAKEHOLDER STATUS	CONTACTED DATE	RESPONSE RECEIVED
and so there is no reason to ble applicable to this application.	ock the project in that regard. No listed activities, other than Listi	ing Notice 1 Activity 27 and Listir	ng Notice 3 Activity 12, is deemed
of significance to this project. H	proposed activity will not make use of water from natural sources a owever, as mentioned in this report, the Applicant will be encourage omply with the conditions of the WUL once approved.		
has submitted a WUL applicatio conditions of the WUL be imple	hat no wetlands occur within the project area. An unnamed tributant in to the DWS. The EIA proposes that should the mitigation measur mented, the impact of mining through the drainage line (within the semed applicable to this application.	res of this document, the aquatic	biomonitoring programme, and the
3. Letters from all relevant service waste must be disposed at a su	providers must be included in the Final BAR with their contact deta tably licenced landfill site.	ails in respect to the collection and	d disposal of waste. All hazardous
been concluded resulting in a appropriately qualified waste ha	nent, the Applicant cannot appoint service providers until the env positive outcome. Once the EA and MP were received (and pr ndling service providers. Copies of the agreements with the servic s proposed that the services of the following companies will be con	ior to commencement), the Apple providers will be placed on reco	licant will contract the services of
 Chemical Toilet Hire & Sev Sanitech (033 386 102 Jus Loos (033 390 156 Aqua Technical Service 	23) 57)		
 General and Hazardous W The Waste Group (03² Spill Tech (031 206 09 Enviroserv (087 086 8³) 	l 563 4228) 19)		
 Spill Tech (031 206 09 	19)		14

STAKEHOLDERS			
TITLE, NAME AND SURNAME	AFFILIATION/KEY STAKEHOLDER STATUS	CONTACTED DATE	RESPONSE RECEIVED
 Skipgo (076 318 5996) 			
4. A copy of the Water Use Licence	e must be included in the FBAR.		
	ation for a WUL was submitted to DWS on 24 November 2020 (ref cannot be appended to this report the FBAR. The Applicant will ng purposes.	e ,	-
5. The DBar states that "the proposed mining site area (S1) will be reached via an existing farm road that passes the site and Inzalo proposes to upgrade the road". Should the road be upgraded, widened or lengthened, then kindly consider Listing Notice 1 Activity 56 in the FBAR.			
-	road, and establishment of haul roads will be below the threshold of be widened by more than 6 meters, or lengthened by more than 1		ns, 2017 in particular Listing Notice
	t be appointed to identify and relocate sensitive plant species prior obtained from KZN Wildlife for the relocation of plants.	to any site works and must ensur	e a Plant Rescue Plan be included
The Applicant will upon receipt of the MP appoint a suitably qualified botanist to identify and relocate sensitive plant species that may be present within the footprint of the approved mining area. The appointment of the botanist, associated pre-commencement walk-through, and securing of plant removal permits, were added as a mitigation measure to this FBAR & EMPR (refer to Part A(1)(h)(viii) The possible mitigation measure that could be applied and the level of risk – Management of vegetation removal). It is proposed that the Plant Rescue Plan be compiled, subsequent to the said site investigation, to ensure its relevance to the site specific conditions and the plants to be identified. The compilation of the Plant Rescue Plan was added as a mitigation measure to this report and the EMPR.			
Mr Ashley Starkey	Department of Human Settlements Water and Sanitation	26 November 2020	No Comments Received

STAKEHOLDERS			
TITLE, NAME AND SURNAME	AFFILIATION/KEY STAKEHOLDER STATUS	CONTACTED DATE	RESPONSE RECEIVED
Miss Simango Ngubo	Department of Transport	26 November 2020	No Comments Received
Me T Kunene	Department of Labour	26 November 2020	No Comments Received
Mr Troy Govendor	Eskom Ltd	26 November 2020	No Comments Received
Director General	National Department of Agriculture Land Reform and Rural Development	26 November 2020	No Comments Received
Heritage Officer	South African Heritage Resources Agency (SAHRA)	26 November 2020	No Comments Received

LAWFUL LAND USERS / SURROUNDING LANDOWNERS / INTERESTED AND AFFECTED PARTIES			
TITLE, NAME AND SURNAME	AFFILIATION /PROPERTY DESCRIPTION	CONTACTED DATE	RESPONSE RECEIVED
Rookhiya Bee Bee Moosa Mr Naaz Moosa	Landowner: ✤ Portion 0 (Remaining Extent) of the farm Thandisizwe No 16691	Inzalo Crushing and Aggregates (Pty) Ltd entered into a lease agreement with Mr Moosa who supports the application.	
Nurden Oliver Wyndham Mr Oliver Nurden (Owner) Mr Ted Hesom (Tenant)	Neighbour:	26 November 2020	No Comments Received
Skhuma Skins of Africa CC	Neighbour:	26 November 2020	No Comments Received
Nanxing Bricks & Tiles (Pty) Ltd Mr David Trevor	 Neighbour: Portion 1 (Remaining Extent) of the farm Alida Mount No 1347. 	26 November 2020	No Comments Received
Alzura Inv CC Sansha Investments CC Mr Sunjeev Singh	 Neighbour: Portion 2 of the farm Thandisizwe No 16691. Portion 0 of the farm Thornridge No 17217. 	26 November 2020	No Comments Received
Greenville Trading 6 CC Mr Andile Buthelezi	 Neighbour: Portion 0 of the farm Whispers No 17478. Portion 10 of Lot 37 No 1294. 	26 November 2020	No Comments Received

LAWFUL LAND USERS / SURROUNDING LANDOWNERS / INTERESTED AND AFFECTED PARTIES			
TITLE, NAME AND SURNAME	AFFILIATION /PROPERTY DESCRIPTION	CONTACTED DATE	RESPONSE RECEIVED
Department of Public Works	Neighbour: Portion 9 of Lot 37 No 1294	26 November 2020	No Comments Received
Mrs Nirmala Singh	Neighbour: Portion 9 of the farm Zeekoegat No 17216.	26 November 2020	No Comments Received
Mr Tom Lam care of Mr Magnus van Rooyen	Lawful Land User: ◆ Portion 0 (Remaining Extent) of the farm Thandisizwe No 16691.	26 November 2020	No additional comments received

SUMMARY OF SECOND PHASE PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PROCESS

As mentioned earlier, the Draft Basic Assessment Report was compiled and all the I&AP's and stakeholders listed above were contacted and provided with a chance to comment on the DBAR. A 30-day commenting period, ending 15 January 2021, was allowed for perusal of the documentation and submission of comments. This commenting period was extended to 22 January 2021.

The Department of Economic Development, Tourism, and Environmental Affairs were the only entity that commented on the DBAR. The comments received from DEDTEA were incorporated into the FBAR to be submitted to DMRE for decision making.

-END OF COMMENTS AND RESPONSE REPORT-